

# United States Court of Appeals

## For the First Circuit

---

No. 14-1952

PEDRO LOPEZ, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; ABEL CANO, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; KEVIN SLEDGE, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; CHARLES DE JESÚS, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; RICHARD BROOKS, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; MASSACHUSETTS HISPANIC LAW ENFORCEMENT ASSOCIATION, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; ROBERT ALVAREZ, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; SPENCER TATUM, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; SHUMEAND BENFOLD, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; ANGELA WILLIAMS-MITCHELL, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; GWENDOLYN BROWN, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; LYNETTE PRAILEAU, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; TYRONE SMITH, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; EDDY CHRISPIN, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; DAVID E. MELVIN, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; STEVEN MORGAN, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; WILLIAM E. IRAOLO, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; JOSÉ LOZANO, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; COURTNEY A. POWELL, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; JAMES L. BROWN, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; GEORGE CARDOZA, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; LARRY ELLISON, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; DAVID SINGLETARY, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; CHARISSE BRITTLE POWELL, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; CATHENIA D. COOPER-PATERSON, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; MOLWYN SHAW, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; LAMONT ANDERSON, individually

and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated;  
GLORIA KINKEAD, individually and on behalf of a class of  
individuals similarly situated; KENNETH GAINES, individually and  
on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; MURPHY  
GREGORY, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals  
similarly situated; JULIAN TURNER, individually and on behalf of  
a class of individuals similarly situated; NEVA GRICE,  
individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly  
situated; DELORES E. FACEY, individually and on behalf of a  
class of individuals similarly situated; LISA VENUS,  
individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly  
situated; RODNEY O. BEST, individually and on behalf of a class  
of individuals similarly situated; KAREN VANDYKE, individually  
and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated;  
ROBERT C. YOUNG, individually and on behalf of a class of  
individuals similarly situated; ROYLINE LAMB, individually and  
on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated; LYNN  
DAVIS, individually and on behalf of a class of individuals  
similarly situated; JAMES A. JACKSON, individually and on behalf  
of a class of individuals similarly situated; JUAN ROSARIO,  
individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly  
situated; LOUIS ROSARIO, JR., individually and on behalf of a  
class of individuals similarly situated; OBED ALMEYDA,  
individually and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly  
situated; DEVON WILLIAMS, individually and on behalf of a class  
of individuals similarly situated; JULIO M. TOLEDO, individually  
and on behalf of a class of individuals similarly situated,

Plaintiffs, Appellants,

MARISOL NOBREGA, individually and on behalf of a class of  
individuals similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF LAWRENCE, MASSACHUSETTS; CITY OF METHUEN, MASSACHUSETTS;  
JOHN MICHAEL SULLIVAN, in his capacity as Mayor of the City of  
Lawrence, Massachusetts; WILLIAM MANZI, III, in his capacity as  
Mayor of the City of Methuen, Massachusetts; CITY OF LOWELL,  
MASSACHUSETTS; CITY OF WORCESTER, MASSACHUSETTS; APPOINTING  
AUTHORITY FOR THE CITY OF LOWELL, MASSACHUSETTS; MICHAEL  
O'BRIEN, in his capacity as City Manager of the City of  
Worcester, Massachusetts; CITY OF BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS; CITY OF  
SPRINGFIELD, MASSACHUSETTS; DOMENIC J. SARNO, JR., in his  
capacity as Mayor of the City of Springfield, Massachusetts;

MASSACHUSETTS BAY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY; DANIEL GRABAUSKAS,  
in his capacity as General Manager, Massachusetts Bay  
Transportation Authority; BOARD OF TRUSTEES OF THE MASSACHUSETTS  
BAY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY,

Defendants, Appellees,

WILLIAM F. MARTIN, in his capacity as Mayor of the City of  
Lowell, Massachusetts; KONSTANTINA B. LUKES, in her capacity as  
Mayor of the City of Worcester, Massachusetts; COMMONWEALTH OF  
MASSACHUSETTS; PAUL DIETL, in his capacity as Personnel  
Administrator for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts,

Defendants.

---

#### **ERRATA SHEET**

The opinion of this Court issued on May 18, 2016, is amended  
as follows:

On page 4, lines 40-41, insert "Massachusetts Municipal  
Association," between "Massachusetts Municipal Lawyers  
Association," and "National Public Employer Labor Relations  
Association".